

**District Program Review Committee**  
**December 1, 2015 - 12:50 -1:50 pm**  
**CCCconfer**  
**MINUTES**

**Present:** Sylvia Thomas, Alexis Gray, Carolyn Quin, David Torres  
**Absent:** Rita Chenoweth

**1. Approval of 11/3/15 Minutes as amended/MSQ/Quin/Torres/Unanimous**

**2. Administrative Issues/Information Only**

- a. MVC Update – Had a second meeting to review CIPRs. The Assessment Committee has insisted that faculty assess all SLOs and all courses. Any reports that didn't have their assessments completed were not accepted. They are working hard to get all their assessments in by February 28<sup>th</sup>. Carolyn explained that the Assessment Committee addresses all issues concerning assessment. Alexis asked what should be done when comments are sent back to the faculty member and they don't respond? Alexis stated that the senate does not have a process in place to enforce this issue. Carolyn will hold a tiered training this spring for those who didn't complete their CIPRs last spring or this fall.
- b. Norco Update – They are in the annual process of updating their template. They have added a component to the CIPR: How has it affected student learning or what kind of changes has it made to student learning? Norco has at least one or two faculty members evaluating the administrative program reviews to better understand the process and allocation of resources, etc. They do not expect any CIPRs to come in until April 20<sup>th</sup>, at which time there maybe five or six submitted. Norco has redesigned their timeline for CIPRs to reflect what is actually happening.
- c. RCC Update – No update.

**3. Program Review Submittals – District Review**

- b. History 2015 – MVC  
**Motion** – to accept MVC History pending revisions/**MSQ/Quin/Gray/Unanimous**  
Need to change answer on page 1 under “Has mission statement changed since last review” to “yes”. Program reviews are difficult to edit in TracDat so Carolyn will send a revised version for uploading.
- c. ESL 2015 - MVC  
**Motion** - to accept MVC ESL pending revisions/**MSQ/Quin/Gray/Unanimous**  
Had problems on the COR page which are now updated. Carolyn will send a revised CIPR with an updated COR report for uploading.
- d. Economics 2015 – NC  
**Motion** – to accept NC Economics/**MSQ/Gray/Quin/Unanimous**  
Alexis checked all CORs with the catalog. Carolyn had a question on page 8 regarding item #2 - Retention and Success rate. She did not feel the analysis was ample. Alexis stated that they have adjusted the question for 2016 to say “list and discuss retention data”. Alexis has not heard back from the Assessment Committee as to whether or not they have accepted that part of the report. The assessment information was very impressive but it was not presented in a way the committee would expect, i.e., in a table. Alexis will forward all comments to the assessment committee.
- e. Computer Information Systems 2015 - NC  
**Motion** - to accept NC Computer Information Systems and CSC/**MSQ/Quin/Gray/Unanimous**  
Report was submitted late (over the summer) due to changes in department chairs. It was suggested in the first section under “Trends and Relevant Data” to change reference to the degree as a TMC (which is now outdated) to an ADT or AST designation.

**4. Program Review Submittals – Information Only**

- a. Dental Hygiene 2015 – MVC

Carolyn wanted to point out that the COR notes included everything that was required at the district level on the status of the curriculum. Committee accepted Dental Hygiene report and it is ready for uploading.

- b. Emergency Medical Services 2015 – MVC  
EMT program must be completed before entering the EMS program. EMS made all the changes the committee asked for. Committee accepted EMS report. It is ready for uploading.
- c. Fire Technology 2015 – MVC  
Once the additional revisions have been made, Carolyn will send the updated version for uploading. Committee accepted Fire Technology pending revisions.
- c. Human Services 2015 – MVC  
They are working on revisions needed. Committee accepted Human Services pending revisions. Carolyn will send the updated report for uploading.
- e. Medical Assisting 2015 – MVC  
Carolyn has asked for the rotation plan for the courses. Committee accepted Medical Assisting pending revisions. Carolyn will send updated report for uploading.

#### 5. Program Review Status Sheet Update and Discussion

- **RCC** – all CIPRs are due in 2016. We may have to extend our meetings in spring for the influx of all CIPRs that are due!
- **MVC** - It is unrealistic for MVC to expect 100% by the deadline. ADJ has hired a new faculty member and they will start working on updating their curriculum and hopefully meet the deadline for 2015. It made working in TracDat more complicated when CAT/CIS split from Business Administration. Business Administration will get their report done but they don't know what to expect from CAT/CIS. They expect English by March or April 2016, and Philosophy promised to submit their report by March 1<sup>st</sup>. Physician Assistant needs to rewrite their report to include all changes in the program. Carolyn needs to make some revisions to Sociology 2014 before submitting.  
**Norco** - has a couple of outstanding CIPRs. Norco is expecting all 2015 CIPRs to be submitted in spring. They also expect to receive Accounting, Dance and English in spring.

#### 6. Open Hearing

- Alexis wanted to remind the committee on how the mission statement should be changed to reflect what we are actually doing. If the generated list of CORs becomes part of our process, she would like to include this in the mission statement by the end of the year for ACCJC.
- David has not been receiving data requests for program reviews from RCC or Norco for the last few years, only for MVC. RCC and Norco turn in their requests to Institutional Effectiveness so David asked if MVC could do the same. Carolyn stated that Institutional Effectiveness is equipped to prepare data requests but they were not ready this year when faculty needed the data to analyze it. Carolyn stated that in the future, when Office 365 is implemented, faculty will be able to see the data in TracDat and be able to write comments in a side panel as they are looking at the data. She will keep David posted.
- Sylvia brought up a concern about whether or not the colleges have established a cycle of review for CORs. Since MVC has put assessment and program review together, they are planning for curriculum review to be ongoing. That way they won't have the time crunch every four years and a report will be generated every year. Sylvia's broader concern is how will we maintain a list or tracking system to ensure that every course is updated at some point within a reasonable cycle? Is this the purview of the Program Review Committee or the purview of the Curriculum Committee? There could potentially be courses, for one reason or another, that are not taught frequently or assessed frequently so, in turn, that course does not get updated. Alexis suggested that maybe these generated COR lists could be submitted annually to the academic senate and they could decide how to proceed. MVC's list is correct since it came into TracDat from CurricUNET. This issue will be revisited at our March meeting. Sylvia will speak to Toni and Naomi about the availability of the COR lists through CurricUNET and we will get Rita's perspective as well.

**Next Meeting:**

**March 1, 2015 / 12:50 – 1:50 / CCCconfer**

**District Program Review Committee**  
**November 3, 2015 - 12:50 -1:50 pm**  
**CCCconfer**  
**AMENDED MINUTES**

**CCCconfer**  
**Dial: 1-888-450-4821**  
**Passcode: 905752**

**Present:** Sylvia Thomas; Alexis Gray; Rita Chenoweth; Carolyn Quin; David Torres (by CCCconfer)

**1. Approval of June 10<sup>th</sup> Minutes / MSC/ Chenoweth/Quin/Unanimous**  
*(September 15<sup>th</sup> and October 6<sup>th</sup> meetings were cancelled).*

**2. Administrative Issues/Information Only**

- a. Discussed our mission statement and charge for the committee. The current charge of the committee was sent to Alexis and will be uploaded to the district website. Carolyn also sent some information which states what our mission is. The committee agreed to create a new charge and mission statement which reflects the changing responsibilities of the DPR Committee.
- b. Need to establish a rotation cycle of CORs for comprehensive program reviews. This will be established after the new mission statement has been created. Each college will send Debbie their CIPR due dates which will be recorded in their own separate spreadsheet to coincide with their college's due dates. The CTE Deans at all three colleges need to decide what two-year cycle they want each CTE program to be on and communicate that schedule to the college program review committees.
- c. 2016 District Administrative Program Review Template for 2016 has been sent to all District units due November 30<sup>th</sup>. Discussion of DAPRs is scheduled for November 11<sup>th</sup> from 8:45 – 12:30.
- d. MVC Update - They have completed the circle with curriculum, assessment and program review by implementing the assessment in TracDat. MVC can run reports on the CORs and curriculum and also on Assessment that relate to the four-year report. They would now like to look at developing some best practices. Some faculty are resisting the use of TracDat. The way TracDat is designed, faculty must enter information in the sequential steps needed to evaluate data or objectives and to develop actions plans. Faculty are still getting used to this way of working.
- e. Norco Update – Revising templates in both the CIPRs and Annuals to include a reflective component regarding resource allocations to show how student learning is impacted. Norco has changed the name of their document to “Program and Unit Review”.
- f. RCC Update – Accreditation visit on November 5<sup>th</sup>. They are making refinements to their template and their goal is to go to online templates which refer to TractDat. They have changed the name of their document to “Program Review and Planning.” All their program reviews are due in spring 2016, and the plan is to have them submitted them to the Deans before summer break. It actually benefits faculty to be part of the budget cycle because this is how they receive funds for a new faculty position, facilities or resources that they need.

**3. Program Review Submittals – Information Only**

- a. Game Development and Simulation 2015 – NC  
Not particularly informative. To be uploaded to the district website.

**4. Program Review Submittals – District Review**

- a. Sociology 2015 – NC  
Discussion followed. Assessment was included in the discussion of goals. Some sections were hard to understand which Alexis explained. Alexis suggested she could explain to the author that the committee was concerned with some of the grammatical errors, and if he would like an additional reader to edit it, they can. To be uploaded to the district website.

**Motion** – to accept Sociology and suggest an editor for grammar.  
**/MSC/Gray/Chenoweth/Unanimous**

- b. Accounting 2015 - MVC  
Good report. To be uploaded to district website.
- c. Chemistry 2015 – MVC  
Good report. To be uploaded to district website.
- d. Mathematics 2015 – MVC  
Good report. To be uploaded to district website.
- e. Reading 2015 – MVC  
MVC's committee asked the Reading instructor to take out a long explanation of why they need the reading lab so it reflects the current stage. A revised document will be submitted for uploading to the district website.
- f. Anthropology 2015 – MVC  
On Page 11 in their summary of curriculum status in the description of Objectives and Data, there is text that is verbatim in both columns. The information in the "Describe" column needs to be deleted, because that information belongs in "Evaluation." A revised document will be submitted for uploading to the district website.
- g. Art 2015 – MVC  
Good report. To be uploaded to district website.
- h. Communication Studies 2015 – MVC  
Good report. To be uploaded to district website.
- i. Psychology 2015 – MVC  
Good report. To be uploaded to district website.

**Motion** – to accept all MVC Reports above: Accounting, Chemistry, Mathematics, Art, Communication Studies, Psychology and Reading (pending revisions) and Anthropology (pending revisions). **MSC/Gray/Chenoweth/Unanimous**

**5. Program Review Status Sheet Update and Discussion**

Postpone until next meeting. Updates will be submitted to Debbie.

**6. Open Hearing**

Norco will submit Economics at the next meeting. Rita will share any pilot programs that may come in as information only at the next meeting. Alexis would like the committee to mull over what they think we should be doing for the betterment of the colleges. Carolyn stated that MVC's Assessment Committee has told faculty they want all SLOs assessed at the time of the four-year report. Are any of the other colleges doing this, and if so, what if the program review has been completed but they haven't done enough assessment? Can the program review be moved forward? To be addressed at the next meeting.

**Adjourned: 1:50 p.m.**

**Next Meeting:**

**December 1, 2015  
12:50 – 1:50  
CCCconfer**

**Riverside Community College District  
District Program Review Committee  
June 10, 2015 – 2:00-3:00 p.m.  
District Office, #307  
Minutes**

**Present:** Rita Chenoweth; Carolyn Quin; Sylvia Thomas; David Torres; Alexis Gray (by CCCconfer)

**1. Approval of 4/7/15 Minutes/MSC/Chenoweth/Gray (1) abstention**

Correct the year “2015” to “2016” under #4. Agenda item 3.a RCC Library moved to last and Norco Library moved next to last. Alexis had informed Carolyn that she had court on April 7<sup>th</sup> and wasn’t able to attend.

**Administrative Issues/Information Only**

- a. MVC Update – Carolyn reported that they have combined their comprehensive program review and their annual program review into one committee and one report. Annuals are called one year reports and the four year reports are the comprehensives. All CIPRs have been entered into TracDat. They are expecting 20 CIPRs due October 1, 2015 and out of 20, only three didn’t have an annual report to turn in. The additional data analysis and the curriculum piece for these three will be added in Fall through TracDat. MVC has set up a separate TracDat module for their ADT disciplines so the program learning outcomes can go into that module and can be assessed.
- b. Norco Update – Alexis reported that of the ten CIPRs they were expecting, they only received five. Some only did their annuals which were allowed to be submitted and they will submit their comprehensives in October. Norco’s policy states that the year faculty complete a comprehensive, they are not required to submit an annual. Their committee is also a combined committee for both the annuals and the comprehensives and one of the goals for next year is to work on their timeline. They will also focus on figuring out what constitutes a program versus a unit versus a discipline so they will know who is responsible for each section. Is there a program review for the ADT or one for the discipline? Need to make sure that there is equal representation on the program review committee. If Alexis isn’t able to report to the academic senate, then she will e-mail the report to them for someone to read.
- c. RCC Update – The final draft of the new template for 2016 is almost done and, hopefully, will be approved at their first meeting in fall. It will include both the comprehensive and annual program reviews. Trainings will be conducted during the fall. No annuals will be due this year. Program reviews will be due in March giving all committees a chance to review everything so that they will be ready for some kind of ranking of resources by fall 2016. Each discipline will create their own rubric as based on the template. All 2015 CIPRs were turned in except for Physical Sciences. Alexis was very impressed with RCC’s new plan and template. All areas will be represented in the program reviews. RCC is looking to form a coaching group (with all groups represented) to review CIPRs only and suggest changes that would make a stronger document and then forward to the Deans.

**3. Program Review Submittals – District Review**

- a. NC Guidance 2015 – Received a score of 2.78 out of 3. They would have liked to see their CIPR based more on their instructional component. In the future, they would like to have a Counseling Student Services Program Review submitted so Guidance could be considered independently and academically. Rita liked how faculty delineated what percentage of their full-time teaching load referred to each program and would like to see this incorporated in more areas. Ready to be uploaded.

**Motion – to accept Guidance 2015 CIPR/MSC/Chenoweth/Gray/Unanimous**

- b. NC Psychology 2015 – Scored a 3! Alexis was so impressed with the new full-time faculty member who wrote this CIPR in the last six months that she would like to use it as a model. Rita liked the format of the retention rate charts which were very easy to read. Ready to be uploaded.

**Motion – to accept Psychology CIPR 2015/MSC/Chenoweth/Gray/Unanimous**

- c. NC Math 2015 – initially wasn't accepted and changes had to be made before the committee did accept it. Page 12 - Norco made a recommendation that the Math 52 COR be addressed and also recommended they indicate whether or not the COR update was a major or minor modification, in place of the yes or no answer. Maybe faculty could be listed as co-contributors instead of asking them to put their name down as editor on a document when they review the COR. Page ten is blank because the previous goals were listed in the RCCD document and they didn't have their own separate goals for Norco. Ready to be uploaded.  
**Motion – to accept Math 2015 CIPR/MSC/Gray/Chenoweth/Unanimous**
  - d. NC Communication Studies 2015 – Scored a 2.8. Initially concerned with the CORs but everything is going through Tech Review right now. Missing data charts such as Retention and Success rates in Section 2. Ready to upload.  
**Motion – to accept Communication Studies CIPR/MSC/Gray/Chenoweth/Unanimous**
  - e. NC Library 2015 – Scored a 2.6. It was missing the discussion section under Retention and Success Rates. Faculty were asked to make sure they include discussion in this section for the next CIPR especially when the success rates are going up and down. Alexis will revise this section to say, "Please discuss the changes". Ready to upload.  
**Motion – to accept Library CIPR/MSC/Gray/Chenoweth/Unanimous**
  - f. RCC Library 2014 – Need to separate out the Student Services portion from the academic portion. On page 6 under D. Programs and Curriculum, remove template instructions. Carolyn will remove the instructions and delete the last blank page and send it to Debbie McDowell for uploading. One of the strongest points of this CIPR was the Collaboration Section.  
**Motion – to accept Library 2014 CIPR/MSC/Chenoweth/Torres/Unanimous**
4. **Program Review Status Sheet Update and Discussion** – update all of RCC's CIPRs due dates to 2016 and update all the Norco CIPRs that came through today as 2015.
5. **Meeting Dates for 2015-2016** – Schedule September 15<sup>th</sup> as the first meeting in Fall? Poll the committee for the best day and time for the 2015-16 dates.

Carolyn is being asked why we still have District Program Review. The District Committee helps keeps continuity, keeps the lines of communication open among the colleges and helps keep the colleges informed. Faculty also want to know why they need an Annual Program Review when they don't have any resource requests.

**Adjourned:** 3:15 p.m.

**Next Meeting:** TBA

**Riverside Community College District  
District Program Review Committee  
April 7, 2015 – 3:30 to 4:30 p.m.  
CCCconfer  
Amended Minutes**

**Present:** Rita Chenoweth; Carolyn Quin; Sylvia Thomas; David Torres  
**Absent:** Alexis Gray

**1. Approval of 3/3/15 Minutes as amended/MS/Chenoweth/Torres/Unanimous**

Under 4a. add "formatting was mentioned" and on #5 MVC – move "over the next two years" after the words "phased out".

**2. Administrative Issues/Information Only**

- a. MVC Update – Now working in Versions 4 & 5 of TracDat as they start their training sessions on Thursday afternoons at 2:00 with Cheryl Honore. Carolyn had written a training manual for Version 4 and now has written a first draft for Version 5.
- b. Norco Update – not present
- c. RCC Update – Over the winter, Rita worked with Wendy McEwen, Mazie Brewington, Susan Mills and Hayley Ashby to finalize their template for the new and improved planning process that will include not just the academic side but also student services and administration. They have a draft out for all the various councils to review. The timeline has not been distributed except to the workgroup. Hopefully the template will be ready to use by the end of the year for 2016.
- d. Data sets for 2015 CIPRs – Carolyn sent David her list of disciplines due for 2015 for data sets needed for MVC. Rita stated that Wendy will be preparing the data sets for RCC program reviews due 2015. Alexis needs to send her list of disciplines due for 2015 to David also.

**3. Program Review Submittals – Information only**

- a. Welding, RCC 2014  
Suggested revisions – (1) remove questions from template (2) add "Welding" to the cover sheet along with the person who prepared the document (3) check for the wrong use of the apostrophe "s" in the document, and (4) on bottom of page 2 – make bullet points of the values listed. Why are they continuing to refer to the District mission? Carolyn will send Rita her corrected version of the program review to implement these revisions.

**4. Program Review Submittals – District Review**

- a. Economics, RCC 2014  
**Motion** – to accept RCC Economics Program Review with minor revisions  
**MS/Chenoweth/Torres/Unanimous**  
Suggested revisions – (1) remove questions from template (2) Under B.1, fourth line the "s" was dropped off the word economics (3) there is a chart on analysis retention and success but it was missing the accompanying chart (4) curriculum chart has date COR was launched but the official date should be the board approval date. This date can be found in CurricUNET on the bottom of the COR screen. Rita will let faculty know they should align to the board approval date for program reviews due for 2016. The SLO assessment information is already included in the annual program review that's why this isn't a full assessment report. Carolyn will send Rita her corrected version for Rita to implement.

**5. Program Review Status Sheet Update and Discussion** – everything is up to date.

**Adjourned:** 4:25 pm

**Next Meeting:** May 5, 2015 / 3:30 – 4:30 / CCCconfer

**Riverside Community College District  
District Program Review Committee  
March 3, 2015 – 3:30 to 4:30 p.m.  
CCCconfer  
Minutes**

**Present:** Rita Chenoweth; Alexis Gray; Carolyn Quin; David Torres; Sylvia Thomas

1. **Approval of 11/4/14 Minutes as amended** - deferred from 12/2/14  
**MSC/Gray/Chenoweth/Unanimous** / Correct misspelling of "Humanities".
2. **Administrative Issues/Information Only**
  - a. Update on DAPR Discussion Meeting held January 14, 2015 – Sylvia reported that all District Administrative Units go through an annual program review process. A meeting is held to discuss program review highlights of the previous year, goals for the coming year, and to review resource needs. These program reviews were due to their VCs on February 5, 2015. The VCs then meet with all their units individually. In April the VCs will meet and decide on one prioritized request list to be submitted to the Chancellor. The DAPRs will be uploaded to the website once the VCs have reviewed them for anyone to access. The Chancellor's response memos will come out around June. Discussion followed.
  - b. MVC Update – moving to TracDat 5 and Carolyn will be meeting with the consultant tomorrow. The use of TracDat 5 for program reviews will start in April since faculty will be re-trained in March for assessment.
  - c. Norco Update – Their first meeting was last Thursday. Their CIPR soft deadline is March 15<sup>th</sup> with a final due date for submission on April 15<sup>th</sup>. There are rubrics attached to their new template to help guide them in their writing. Alexis will send this rubric to Carolyn and Rita for their information.
  - d. RCC Update – First meeting will be March 19<sup>th</sup> for review of Library and Physical Sciences. The Institutional Effectiveness workgroup, which is part of strategic planning, has a first draft of the new template which they have submitted to the various council chairs and constituents for feedback. They are reconvening next week to take a look at the timeline. This new template is for all units: student services, administrative, annual, and instructional.
3. **Program Review Submittals – Information only** - None
4. **Program Review Submittals – District Review**
  - a. **Library**, MVC 2014 (template plus TracDat)  
**Motion** – to accept MVC Library CIPR for 2014/**MSC/Gray/Chenoweth/Unanimous**  
This program review was mixed with the TracDat report. It is ready to be uploaded to website. Formatting was mentioned.
  - b. **Sociology**, MVC 2014  
**Motion** – to accept MVC Sociology CIPR for 2014 with pending revisions  
**MSC/Chenoweth/Torres/Unanimous**  
Carolyn will speak to Eric Thompson to find out what's going on with the chart on page 6. It looks like the page needs to be scaled down with a few other minor fixes. Last paragraph on page 5 needs to be reworded.
  - c. **Economics**, MVC 2014 – Eddy Chi is on leave of absence until next academic year. It was suggested that the 4 points on page 3 under "Data Analysis and Environmental Scan" be removed. Debbie McDowell will make that edit and it will be ready to upload. Carolyn had asked Eddy to include what the different pedagogical practices were as referred to in the last paragraph on page 3, but it was never included.  
**Motion** – to accept MVC Economics 2014 as revised/**MSC/Gray/Chenoweth/Unanimous**



- d. World Languages, RCC 2013 – Rita needs to send Debbie McDowell the revised final CIPR for uploading.

**5. Program Review Status Sheet Update and Discussion**

Norco – hope to have all their 2014 CIPRs submitted by April.

RCC – hope to have all their 2014 CIPRs submitted by April.

MVC – need to remove Speech Pathology from status sheet. Program has been discontinued.

Carolyn will be working on the final report for Physician Assistant as the program is phased out over the next two years due to loss of accreditation.

**Reports to be expected for April 7<sup>th</sup>:**

RCC – Economics and Welding

Norco – all coming in May

MVC – Carolyn will mention the status of Humanities for 2013 to Chris Rocco.

**Next Meeting:**

**April 7, 2015**

**3:30 – 4:30**

**CCCconfer**