DISTRICT PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE February 5, 2013 2:30 – 4:30 p.m. -- #307, District Office **MINUTES**

Members Present:

Chenoweth, Rita; Thomas, Jim; Thomas, Sylvia; Torres, David <u>Absent:</u> Crasnow, Sharon; Fontaine, Robert; Gibbs, Travis; Nelson, Lee; Quin, Carolyn;

Approval of November 6, 2012/MSC/Chenoweth/Torres Approval of December 4, 2012 Minutes/MSC/Torres/Chenoweth

1. Administrative Issues

- Comprehensive Program Review Training to be held on Friday, February 8, 2013. College Program Review Chairs to put on the training for next year.
 Revised Comprehensive Program Review Forms – Jim reviewed all revisions made to the
 - Comprehensive forms and Background and Guidelines. The following revisions were suggested: i. Front Cover on Forms and Background and Guidelines - replace "Office of Institutional
 - Effectiveness" with "Office of Educational Services" and change last revised date to February 2013.
 - ii. Mandating use of the data analysis tables on Page 3.
 - ii. Page 3.C. Make "Efficiency Analysis" #4 after Enrollment Analysis, Success Analysis, and Retention Analysis.
- b. Background and Guidelines the following revisions were suggested:
 - i. Page 2 place paragraph 4 (The intrinsic purpose....) before paragraph 3 (The most important extrinsic....)
 - Page 4 revise chart to include a box for "RCCD Strategic Planning Process" (not all program reviews will go through this planning process. It will be on an as needed basis only. Is a narrative needed to explain?)
 - iv. Page 6 2^{nd} paragraph, 3^{rd} bullet place a comma after Program Review.
 - Page 7 Revise last sentence in Timeframe to state: "November (Program Reviews can be submitted anytime during the fall semester, but the final submittal date to the College Program Review Committee is November 1st).
 - vi. Suggestion to stress at the workshop on Friday that if faculty have other data needs that apply specifically to their program review, they should feel free to use it in the data analysis portion.
 - vii. The revised CIPR Form and Background and Guidelines will be uploaded to the website and sent to all faculty who rsvp'd for Friday, February 8th.

Motion – to approve the CIPR Form and Background and Guidelines revisions as set forth above/MSC/Chenoweth/Torres/Unanimous

- c. Confirmed the following meeting dates for 2013, 1st Tuesday of the month: March 5th; April 2nd; May 7th and June 4th
- 2. District Program Review Submittals review for common curriculum and continuity.
 - i. Life Sciences, RCC
 - ii. Kinesiology, RCC vote: 5 ayes/0 nays (Quin voted by proxy)
 - Motion to receive Life Sciences for RCC/MSC/Chenoweth/Torres/ vote: 4 ayes/1 nay (Quin voted by proxy) Motion Passed

Motion – to receive Kinesiology for RCC/MSC/Torres/Chenoweth/ vote: 5 ayes/0 nay (Quin voted by proxy) Motion Passed

iii. Early Childhood Education, Norco

Motion – to receive Early Childhood Education, Norco

Amended Motion - to accept Early Childhood Education for Norco and RCC

MSC/Chenoweth/Torres/ vote: 5 ayes/0 nays Motion Passed/Unanimously

Next Meeting:

Tuesday, March 5, 2013 2:30 – 4:30 District Office, #307

Meeting Adjourned – 3:30 p.m.

DISTRICT PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE March 5, 2013 2:30 – 4:30 p.m. -- #307, District Office **MINUTES (Revised)**

Members Present: Chenoweth, Rita; Quin, Carolyn; Thomas, Jim; Thomas, Sylvia; Torres, David

Absent:

Crasnow, Sharon; Fontaine, Robert; Gibbs, Travis; Nelson, Lee

Approval of February 5, 2013 Minutes as amended/MSC/Quin/Chenoweth

1. Administrative Issues

- a. Report out on Comprehensive Program Review Training February 8, 2013
 - This is the last Comprehensive Program Review Training as a District. The Colleges should take advantage of having a district curriculum person present at their College CIPR Trainings next year.
 - Good feedback from David Torres on the data charts required for the CIPRs. Naomi and Toni touched on separate CurricUNET issues.
 - Changes to the Gen Ed SLOs, approved by the board, were generated from the Gen Ed Workgroup chaired by Jim Elton. Rita stated that there is nothing in the Gen Ed SLOs about artistic expression. She may want to join them at their next meeting on Friday, March 8th at 2:00 in the Hall of Fame on RCC. Sylvia will send Rita the agenda for that meeting.

b. Update status of Program Reviews from each College

• When an RCCD document is submitted by a particular college with revisions, it will be submitted as that College's program review. Debbie will send out a list of all program reviews due for the year 2014 and 2015 to the program review chairs along with a status list of all program reviews.

c. Notification of the process for Annual Program Reviews

- Norco has modified their annual program review document and their timeline. They are reviewed and received by the College Program Review Committee and the final document is submitted by May 15, 2013.
- The Moreno Valley senate approved a process that includes both the comprehensive and the annual program reviews with the same deadline of October 1st. They are submitted to the Academic Planning Council/Program Review Committee in November.
- At Riverside the VP reviews all the annual program reviews to determine resources and for implementation.
- Annual Program Reviews need to be updated to include distance education information to meet accreditation requirements.

2. Program Review Submittals - Information Only

- a. Dental Hygiene, MVC
- b. Speech Pathology, MVC

Medical Assisting – It was accepted by MVC program review committee on 2/19/13 and will be submitted to the District Program Review Committee once revisions have been made.

Dental Assistant Program – Due date has been moved up to Fall 2013. This program review will be prepared by the new faculty member, Lidia Hulshof and submitted to the APC/MVC program review committee.

Astronomy and Physics, MVC – No previous program reviews have ever been submitted for Moreno Valley so the due date will be Fall 2013.

Honors, MVC – Should Carolyn move the due date to Fall 2013? The document will be received as a 2012 document whenever it's approved by the college program review committees. The core information in the Honors program review (which has been submitted by RCC) is probably the same for all three colleges and each college will review the RCC document and submit their own document with any revisions they may have.

3. Program Review Submittals – District Review

- a. Political Science, MVC
 - Page 5 graph is confusing. Blue background needs to be removed.
- b. Guidance, MVC
 - Page 15 blue background needs to be removed from the graph.
- c. Life Science, MVC
 - Document and graphs needs formatting.
- d. Early Childhood Education, MVC

Motion - to receive the above four program reviews/MSC/Quin/Torres/Unanimous

- e. Geography, MVC
 - MVC lost their full time faculty in Geography. The screening committee didn't review this one but the APC/Program Review Committee accepted it. They wanted to know where the efficiency analysis was for MVC. Should a comprehensive program review be submitted when there is no full time faculty in that discipline? It was suggested that it would be best to submit something so there would be a record that a program review was conducted.
 - MVC to share revisions to this document with Rita for the RCC document and MVC will approve the RCC document as their own at the District's April 2nd meeting.

Motion – to table until RCC brings their program review forward to the April 2nd meeting. Both the MVC and RCC document will be reviewed that time. This one document will be received as 3 separate documents.

Kinesiology MVC will be on the April 2nd agenda.

Next Meeting:

Tuesday, April 2, 2013 2:30 – 4:30 District Office, #307

Meeting Adjourned – 3:50 p.m.

DISTRICT PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE April 2, 2013 2:30 – 4:30 p.m. -- #307, District Office (AMENDED) MINUTES

Members Present:

Thomas, Sylvia; Thomas, Jim; Chenoweth, Rita; Quin, Carolyn; Torres, David

Absent:

Crasnow, Sharon; Fontaine, Robert; Gibbs, Travis; Nelson, Lee

1. Approval of March 5, 2013 Minutes/MSC/Quin/Torres/Unanimous

Discussion followed:

- Our copy editor will make the suggested formatting revisions to Moreno Valley's CIPRs approved on March 5th.
- It was suggested that each college provide a process chart showing the workflow of their program reviews to ensure dissemination to the appropriate committees after PRC approval. Jim to contact Natalie Hannum at MVC and Wolde-Ab Isaac at RCC for these charts.
- The next Gen Ed Workgroup meeting is scheduled for April 19th at 2:00 in the Hall of Fame on RCC.

2. Administrative Issues

- a. COR verification for 2012 CIPRs by College It was suggested that each college add a check box to their program review check sheet verifying that CORs have been updated. Carolyn and Rita agreed to this. If a course isn't exclusive to one college, then the workload of updating the CORs should be divided among the colleges. Carolyn will convey this information to Cheryl Honore regarding the MVC Accounting program review.
- b. Review of Program Review Status Sheet and list of CIPRs due Fall 2012 Revised and updated the overall program review status sheet along with the CIPR Fall 2012 list. The "Submitted" column will be removed from all spreadsheets. The committee reviewed the status of the seriously overdue CIPRs. It's important that the overdue CIPRs are completed for reporting to the Chancellor.
 - Honors, RCCD MVC and Norco to review Honors document.
 - Geography accepted by MVC 12/12/12. To be received by RCC on 4/18/13.
 - Rita will send me Film Studies and Political Science documents received 2/21/13. Rita to check on Chemistry document that needed revisions.
 - Psychology, NORCO no FT faculty at Norco. Should the program review due date be moved up?
 - MVC Astronomy and Physics previously under Physical Sciences. MVC Accounting previously under Business Education. MVC Business Information Technology Systems previously under CIS/CAT.

3. Program Review Submittals – Information Only

ADJ Law Enforcement, MVC

Motion – to receive ADJ Law Enforcement for MVC/MSC/Quin/Chenoweth/Unanimous

- Password to MVC program review website will be removed.
- 4. <u>Program Review Submittals District Review</u> Kinesiology, MVC Motion – to accept Kinesiology for MVC/MSC/Quin/Chenoweth/Unanimous
- 5. Open Hearing Each college to submit a group of program reviews for the next District meeting.

Adjourned 3:30 p.m.

Next Meeting:

Tuesday, May 7, 2013 2:30 – 4:30 District Office, #307

DISTRICT PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE June 4, 2013 2:30 – 4:30 p.m. -- #307, District Office **MINUTES**

Members Present:

Thomas, Sylvia; Thomas, Jim; Chenoweth, Rita; Quin, Carolyn; Torres, David

Guest: David Vakil, Dean of Instruction, MVC

 <u>Approval of April 2, 2013 Minutes as amended</u>/MSC/Quin/Chenoweth/Unanimous (May 7th meeting cancelled) Remove 2nd sentence under item #3 - "... use this program review as a model..." An amendment was made to the agenda to include Geography program review for Norco.

2. Administrative Issues

- a. Process charts from each college showing workflow for accreditation purposes Rita will connect with Dr. Isaac during the summer, who is formulating a more current version for RCC for submission in Fall. RCC has a new cover sheet for their individual program reviews which Rita will email to Debbie. Moreno Valley's process chart is in flux and should be ready for submission by Fall. Jim submitted the process chart for Norco which Debbie will email to Carolyn, Rita and Sylvia.
- b. Status of 2011 and 2012 program reviews
 - Debbie will email an updated status list for 2011 and 2012 program reviews to each college program review director.
 - Communication Studies, MVC has been extended to 2014 due to no FT faculty and Music, MVC and Fire Technology have been extended to Fall 2013.
 - Rita will send the update CORs for Dance to be added to the program review and the revised version will be uploaded to the website.
- c. Each college website is linked to the District Program Review website.
- d. Jim Thomas is stepping down as District Program Review Director. Rita Chenoweth was congratulated as the new District Program Review Director for 2013-14.

3. Program Review Submittals – Information Only

- a. Film Studies, RCC Very impressive document prepared by Cynthia Morrill.
- b. Cosmetology, RCC Late in submitting this 2011 document; CORs have not been updated.

4. Program Review Submittals – District Review

- a. Honors, Norco Excellent document prepared by Lyn Greene. Motion – to receive Honors Norco/MSC/Quin/Chenoweth/Unanimous
- b. Honors, RCC Motion – to receive Honors RCC/MSC/Chenoweth/Quin/Unanimous
- c. Geography, MVC/NOR/RCC Motion – to receive Geography as RCC, MVC and Norco/MSC/Quin/Chenoweth/Unanimous
- Political Science, Norco formatting issues will be fixed by our copy editor. Courses 2H and 4H have not been offered due to reduction in courses. Why was there a long-term resource request for laptops? Isn't this an annual program review request? Jim stated that it was included in the APR and they were just making sure all their bases were covered.
 Motion to receive Political Science Norco/MSC/Chenoweth/Quin/Unanimous
- e. Political Science, RCC Discussion on all CORs not being updated. MVC was prohibited from adding courses 3, 5 and 8 into their catalog due to an incomplete listing of curriculum by RCC, and therefore, the TMC that MVC had prepared could not go through. RCC faculty was asked to update 3, 5 and 8 but to no avail. MVC faculty cannot initiate the updates because the courses are not in the catalog. Who becomes the person that needs to initiate moving program reviews forward for processing and making sure CORs are updated the program review committee, curriculum committee, department chair, Dean of Instruction, etc? This has been a growing concern over the last year.

Motion – to receive Political Science/Quin/Chenoweth

Amended Motion – to table Political Science for RCC until issues are resolved MSC/Quin/Chenoweth/Unanimous

Reason: The Riverside Program Review Committee passed Political Science but was tabled by the District Program Review Committee due to RCC not communicating or cooperating with their colleagues on matters of general interest to provide continuity of academic programs within the district and having an incomplete listing of curriculum.

f. English, MVC – This is an older 2011 document. What do we do with good suggestions from program reviews? For example English suggested priority registration for English students registering for their next English class since registration is not guaranteed. Discussion followed. This is a complex situation. We need to give the discipline feedback and let them know their suggestion was heard and discussed. Another issue for larger disciplines, such as English and Math, have PT faculty working on program review and assessment activities without compensation. It would be advantageous to have administrators sitting on the college program review committees who would hear and have a chance to consider any suggestions and act upon them, if possible.

Motion - to receive English MVC/MSC/Quin/Chenoweth/Unanimous

- g. Philosophy, MVC Motion – to receive Philosophy MVC/MSC/Chenoweth/Quin/Unanimous
- h. Guidance/Counseling, RCC Rita to send me a chart to be included in the program review. RCC was cooperative in updating their curriculum. Carolyn suggested using the MVC model for the Norco Guidance program review which was tabled at Norco.
 Motion to receive Guidance/Counseling RCC/MSC/Unanimous
- **5. Open Hearing** Committee agreed to keep monthly meetings on the 1st Tuesday of each month from 2:30-4:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:10 p.m.

Next meeting:

Tuesday, September 3, 2013 2:30 – 4:30 District Office, #307

Riverside Community College District District Program Review Committee September 3, 2013 – 2:30 to 4:30 p.m. District Office – 1533 Spruce St. Riverside Conference Room #307

Amended Minutes

Members Present:

Thomas, Sylvia; Gray, Alexis; Chenoweth, Rita; Quin, Carolyn; Torres, David

1. Approval of Minutes from 6/4/13/MSC/Quin/Torres (1) abstention - A. Gray

2. Administrative Issues

- i. Need process charts showing workflow for RCC and MVC Carolyn will email the link to the updated MVC flow chart and Rita will be forwarding her process chart also.
- ii. Review Program Review Status sheet:

<u>Norco</u> - Alexis has discussed Norco's long overdue CIPRs with Diane Dieckmeyer. **Psychology** – was submitted but not approved. There is no FT faculty. Sylvia suggested taking this to the Cabinet Meeting next week to get feedback from the VPs regarding this issue.

Business Administration – tabled, 2nd draft needed for college approval. **CIS/CAT/CSC/ENE** – Alexis stated that CIS/CAT is in transition as they are shifting to Gaming but this shouldn't affect this 2011 program review.

Counseling/Guidance – tabled. Alexis will follow up on this program review. Moreno Valley editor may be able to extract Norco's portion from the initial document, if needed.

Humanities – Alexis asked for an extension to Fall 2014 due to no FT faculty. Alexis was asked to get written concurrence from the college committee and VP for this recommendation and forward that correspondence to the District Committee.

Kinesiology - Alexis to engage Dr. Wallstrom on this program review.

Life Sciences – Alexis to follow up.

Mathematics – Diane Dieckmeyer is working on Math.

Moreno Valley

BITS - 2nd draft needed for college approval.

Communication Studies – FT faculty member retired. 2nd draft needed for college approval. Carolyn will work with the Dean on this one.

History – RCCD wrote this program review for across the district and choose not to include Military Science. Since Military Science is not assigned to any department of MVC, MVC will go ahead and use the RCCD document. Add to District agenda for October 1st meeting.

Honors – extended to Fall 2013.

Humanities – extended to Fall 2013.

Human Services -2^{nd} draft needed for college approval. Carolyn met with James Banks. She will also discuss with the Dean or VP.

Medical Assisting – in progress.

<u>Riverside</u>

Political Science – Need updated COR list. Add to the October 1st District agenda.

iii. Changing Yearly Cycles – Music, MVC will be moved to 2013. Carolyn has discussed this with her VP who was in agreement. Discussion followed regarding dividing program reviews due in 2015 among 2014 and 2016. Sylvia stated that since comprehensive program reviews are now college-driven, this should be their decision. How do the colleges want to integrate their CIPRs with their planning process and assessments? Colleges need to agree on the cycle schedule when shared curriculum is involved. A discussion took place regarding colleges moving in a different direction in terms of the way they are going to cycle their CIPRs.

- iv. It was suggested that the disciplines could start updating their CORs the year before the CIPR is due.
- 3. Program Review Submittals Information Only
 - Criminal Justice, RCC Remove references to Fall 2008 and previous years including outdated charts. Narrative needs restructuring. Remove Marilyn Martinez-Flores' name. Remove references to Anthropology. Remove end comments. Rita to make modifications suggested above along with edits from Carolyn for a final document for uploading.
 - ii. EMS, MVC Replace RCC's mission statement with MVC's. Add a statement to the History section stating that when the program originated, EMS, which was located at Ben Clark, was an off-site center for Riverside. Resource requests are vague. Carolyn will check on their resource needs and data to support those needs. Once the MVC EMS program has revised the document and submitted it to Carolyn, it will be ready for uploading.

4. Program Review Submittals – District Review

 Chemistry, RCC – Appendices were removed. Headers to be removed referencing November 2011 and it will be ready to upload.

Motion - to accept Chemistry, RCC/MSC/Quin/Gray/Unanimous

Political Science – need updated COR list. Add to District agenda for October 1st meeting.

Meeting Adjourned at 4:20 p.m.

Next Meeting Date:

Tuesday, October 1, 2013 2:30 – 4:30 Conference Room #307

Riverside Community College District District Program Review Committee October 1, 2013 – 2:30 to 4:30 p.m. District Office – 1533 Spruce St. Riverside Conference Room #307

Minutes

Members Present:

Rita Chenoweth; Alexis Gray; Carolyn Quin; David Torres

Members Absent:

Thomas, Sylvia

1. Approval of Minutes from 9/3/13/MSC/Gray/Quin

2. Administrative Issues

- i. Process charts showing workflow for RCC and MVC Carolyn Quin submitted MVC's process chart which was senate approved. Rita will send the link for RCC's process chart.
- ii. Review Background and Guidelines and CIPR template make corrections to the 2013 front page template to include Alexis Gray and Carolyn Quin. RCC and Norco will be developing a new template for 2014 which will be submitted to the District for review. Discussion followed regarding a new process for CIPRs in 2014, individual to each college, and it was agreed that they need to keep the shared curriculum portion.
- iii. Process for editing program reviews since there is no longer a District Editor Each college will do basic editing at their own screening committee and upload to their website. Pending consultation with the District, the committee felt that the District website should eventually link to the college's website. Some editorial guidelines will be established, e.g., deleting all the directions on the template and making sure all charts are included in specified sections, etc. RCC's goal is for the Annual Program Review to reference the CIPR.
- iv. Review Program Review Status sheet/Separate out CTE disciplines Broke out the CTE programs due to Title 5 Ed Code 78016 which states that Perkins funded CTE programs need to be reviewed every two years but their curriculum is not required to be updated every two years. Rita will email the Ed Code document to the chairs for their reference. Debbie will send the department/discipline list to the chairs so they can see how particular disciplines such as Engineering, CIS, CAT, Gaming, etc. should be separated out on the status sheet.

Report Out for Norco - Alexis Gray

- <u>Humanities</u> The Norco Program Review Committee unanimously approved of changing Humanities due date to Spring 2015 since a FT faculty member will be hired in Fall of 2014.
- <u>Psychology</u> The associate faculty member responsible for Psychology has agreed to submit the program review again to the Norco Program Review Committee despite having no FT faculty in the discipline.
- <u>Business Administration</u> Business was submitted and will be on the agenda for Norco's October Program Review meeting.
- <u>Counseling/Guidance</u> still working on it.
- <u>CIS/CAT/CSC</u> still working on it. Engineering for 2010 has been completed and is on the District website.
- <u>Life Sciences</u> still following up. Due 2012.

• <u>Mathematics</u> – still following up. Due 2011.

The above program reviews have been turned over to the VP of Academic Affairs to enforce submissions.

<u>No FT faculty at the College</u> – This was addressed at our last meeting and the question was posed to the VC Cabinet meeting on September 12th. They felt it was best not to delay the program review. They preferred paying an associate or retired faculty member to come back and complete the program review instead of waiting until a FT faculty member is hired. What entity would pay the associate or retired faculty member for taking on this job?

3. Program Review Submittals – District Review

- i. Political Science, RCC Tabled until the COR list is received.
- ii. History, MVC Motion – to accept MVC's CIPR for History/MSC/Quin/Gray/Unanimous
- iii. Kinesiology, Norco Motion – to accept Norco's CIPR for Kinesiology/MSC/Gray/Quin/Unanimous

Next Meeting - Rita will meet with Sylvia to see whether or not we need to cancel our November 5th meeting to allow the Fall 2013 program reviews to be submitted to their college committees first. The December 3rd meeting will be rescheduled for December 10th to accept any District submittals at that time.

Motion - to adjourn at 4:10 p.m./MSC/Gray/Quin/Unanimous

Riverside Community College District District Program Review Committee December 10, 2013 – 2:30 to 4:30 p.m. District Office – 1533 Spruce St. Riverside Conference Room #307

Minutes

Members Present:

Rita Chenoweth; Alexis Gray; Carolyn Quin; David Torres

Members Absent:

Thomas, Sylvia

1. Approval of Minutes from 10/1/13/MSC/Gray/Quin/Unanimous

2. Administrative Issues

- i. Communication Studies for MVC has been moved to 2014 due to no FT faculty in that discipline.
- ii. February 7, 2014/Flex Day Comprehensive Program Review Training has been cancelled for February 7th due to accreditation activities that day. Training dates have been rescheduled for:

Tuesday, March 18, 2014

2:30 – 4:30 p.m. District Office, #319

Friday, April 25, 2014 1:00 – 3:00

District Office, #319

Invite Toni and Naomi to attend for training in CurricUNET.

3. Program Review Submittals – District Review

 Political Science, RCC – COR updated list received.
 Motion – Carolyn moved with great appreciation to accept the updated CORs for Political Science's CIPR for 2012/MSC/Quin/Gray/Unanimous To be uploaded to website.

ii. Business Administration, Norco

Motion – to accept Business Administration's CIPR for 2011 MSC/Gray/Quin/Unanimous

Debbie will remove reference "submitted 2011 for 2009" on the cover sheet, delete template directions, add page numbers and delete faculty names under History/Norco College on page 5. Then it will be ready for uploading and email copy to Alexis.

iii. World Languages, Norco

Motion – to accept World Languages' CIPR for 2013/**MSC/Gray/Quin/Unanimous** Debbie will add 2013 to cover sheet, remove template directions and last page. Then it will be ready for uploading and email copy to Alexis.

4. Report Out – Reviewed Program Review Status Sheet for updates. History MVC needs to be uploaded along with Kinesiology for Norco. For faculty who will not turn in a CIPR, the VP of Academic Affairs needs to contact that faculty member themselves. Alexis needs to review college minutes from 4/25/13 to see why Counseling/Guidance for Norco was tabled. Change Astronomy and Physics to "Physics/Astronomy. Rita will check on Humanities for RCC and see about missing appendices and is it ready to be uploaded?

Adjourned 3:50 pm/MSC/Gray/Torres