

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
January 25, 2007 2:00 – 5:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Hall, Lewis  
Kennedy, Stephen  
McKee-Leone, Virginia

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia  
Dumer, Olga  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Elizaldes, Andre  
Loewenstein, Gaither  
Thomas, Jim

**RCCD**

DiThomas, Debbie  
Kauffman, Kristina

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Burchett, Gregory  
Davin, Richard  
Green, Monica  
Osgood-Treston, Brit  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**

Conyers, Lisa  
G Galicia, Felipe

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Flick, Arend  
Pavlis, Bonnie

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron

**Staff:** David Torres

**Guests:** Ron Vito; Paula Stafford; Delores Middleton

1. **Approval of 11/30/06 Minutes – MSC/Hall/Kennedy**
2. **Administrative Issues –**
  - a. Instructional Program Review – Round two, 2007 – 2010 Background and Guidelines' can be accessed on the website. Our focus for this meeting will be on the Non-Instructional Program Review draft.
  - b. Updated Calendar 2007 – Heavy agenda for February 22, 2007 meeting. The plan is to wrap up Program Reviews in March 22, 2007 meeting.
  - c. Update on Fall 2006 Program Review Cohort Revisions – Most Fall 2006 Program Reviews were approved with minor revisions.
  - d. Training on Annual Program Review Documents – March 2007 due date
3. **Program Review Submittals – Comments from each committee member will be compiled and e-mailed to appropriate faculty member**
  - a. **Community Interpretation** – Not present
  - b. **Economics** – Submitted by Amber Casolari  
**Comments:** Has DAC approval. State how many people are in the discipline among all three campuses. State plans for the future. Develop history section. Mention collaboration with student services. Set up reasons for conclusions and move to end of the document. Revise mission statement. Assessment committee asked them to revisit assessment plan after one year due to lack of specificity. A concern was voiced that there were no measurable objectives and the assessment was too general. There needs to be a link created between objectives in program review and the objectives that are in the districts strategic plan. Resource needs should be linked to the objectives that are trying to be accomplished.

**Motion** – Return the review to the discipline without the approval of the committee and resubmit in March with measurable objectives and a clearer methodology for measuring student learning outcomes and include resource piece in the annual report. **MSC/Loewenstein/DiThomas**

c. **Physician Assistant** – Submitted by Delores Middleton and Paula Stafford

**Comments:** Needs DAC Approval. Good document. There was a concern with the drop in student enrollment. Is the quality of students changing? New prerequisites needed. Would like to see narrative.

**Motion** – to approve pending minor revisions. **MCS/DiThomas/Dumer**

d. **Physical Science** – Not Present

#### 4. Non-Instructional Program Review Draft

a. Background information for Non-Instructional Program Review is essentially the same as it was for instructional program review.

b. Page 3 a little more specificity on link to Student Learning Outcomes.

c. Planning – we need to link Instructional Program Reviews and Non-Instructional Program Reviews in an appropriate way so that if a need arises in an instructional area chances are it's a need for something that a non-instructional area has to respond to and provide for.

d. Create a document where needs are looked at in advance.

e. Non-instructional due September 1<sup>st</sup>, Absolute Final version due May 15<sup>th</sup>.

f. Needs a more specific way of defining units in program review.

**Motion** – Look over non-instructional program review draft and present in March meeting with recommendations. **MSC/DiThomas/Loomis**

#### 5. Next Meeting:

**Thursday, February 22, 2007**

**2:00 – 5:00 p.m.**

**District Office, Third Floor**

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
February 22, 2007 2:00 – 5:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Green, Monica  
Hall, Lewis  
Kennedy, Stephen  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia  
Dumer, Olga

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Loewenstein, Gaither  
Pavlis, Bonnie  
Thomas, Jim, Co-Chair

**RCCD**

DiThomas, Debbie  
Kauffman, Kristina

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Burchett, Gregory  
Davin, Richard  
Hall, Deborah  
McKee-Leone, Virginia

**Moreno Valley**

Conyers, Lisa  
Galicia, Felipe  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Elizaldes, Andre  
Flick, Arend

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron

**Staff:** David Torres

**Guests:** Ron Pardee; Patti Worsham; Diana Webster; John Young; Amber Casolari; Nancy Gall

1. **Approval of 1/25/07 Minutes** – MSC/Kennedy/Bufalino pending revision – removal of Gaither's name from 1/25/07 minutes.
2. **Administrative Issues**

Deborah Hall to substitute for Debbie DiThomas. Michael McQuead to substitute for Rebecca Loomis. Brit Osgood-Treston has joined a new committee and she will be removed from this committee.

- a. Instructional Program Review – Round Two – Concerns will be e-mailed to Kristina Kauffman and Jim Thomas. Reviewed edits by Bonnie Pavlis and Sharon Crasnow. SLO's should tie into student learning resources and strategic planning. Replace the word "self-study" with "review". Include Academic Planning Council after Program Review Committee. Approved by all three senates. Sharon Crasnow to take to senate meeting on Monday, February 26, 2007. In the Summary Analysis section ask for a list of SLO's for discipline or program as a whole.

Suggestion to add the wording, "the following data should be included on Page 10, item #1: (1) FTES (2) Student success rates (3) Number of degrees and certificates awarded. Add "by demographics overall" to item #7. Some disciplines need for raw data not composite data for enrollment by class, fill rates. Have training available for faculty who need this type of data. Kristina will make revisions and e-mail clean document. Second training on Program Review documents due 3/7/07. Have general department or campus breakout.

- b. Additional Updates for Calendar 2007 – Program Reviews need to be submitted one week prior to committee meeting.

3. **Program Review Submittals – Comments from each committee member will be compiled and e-mailed to appropriate faculty member**

a. **Business Administration – Ron Pardee, Diana Webster, Patti Worsham**

Comments: Very well organized. Need plan to improve low student success rates not mentioned in Program Review. Resources need to be linked to outcomes they hope to achieve. Confusion regarding on-line classes and offerings. If statistics show low success rates with on-line classes, then there's a good argument not to offer on-line classes. Better success rate with face-to-face classes. Hybrid least improvement.

**Motion – MSC/Crasnow/Green - to approve Business Program Review with minor revisions for clarity**

b. **Photography – Nancy Gall**

Comments: Rework History Section. Remove names that are mentioned in the History section. Include where students with certificates go for employment. There should be a strong link to the type of needs that employers require. Clarify that students are getting employed after receiving certificates. Discussion about curricular changes should be tied to employment. Make point of technical aspect of photo instead of just from Artistic point of view. Try to combine the artistic aspect and technical aspect of photography. Strengthen faculty along with cross listing courses. List strengths you bring to the table and offer to the artists. Needs SLO's for certificate program. Develop SLO's: Needs of students and how SLO's are tied to the needs of employment. "Where to go from here" section should include some statements about developing program level SLO's and conducting a viability analysis on the certificate program with the idea of increasing student enrollment.

**Motion – MSC/Crasnow/Hall - Conditional Approval pending DAC approval and some editorial corrections.**

**Amendment – MSC/ Loewenstein/ Bufalino** Development of SLO's on Program Level and viable study for certificate

c. **Economics – John Young/ Amber Casolari**

Comments: DAC Had Approved. Econ 5 needs more information. Econ 6 same as Poli sci 6. Econ 6 is an elective. Poli Sci 6 can be a non-elective depending on major. Issues with enrollment at the city campus prevent Econ 5 from being offered there because it is considered an elective type course. Link resource request with district strategic planning and/ or SLO's.

**Motion – MSC/Crasnow/Loewenstein** approved

4. **Non-Instructional Program Review**

Comments: Name should be changed to Administrative Program Review.

Comments: Section F. Collaboration with Other Units Editorial Suggestions: "Discuss any collaborative efforts you have undertaken with other units, instructional or non-instructional, at RCCD" (Eliminate all other words until you get to offer) In front of offer put a semi-colon and then state "offer an assessment of success and challenges; and evaluate potential changes in collaborative efforts." Editorial Changes on Page 7. Clarification of item 7

5. **Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, March 22, 2007  
2:00 – 5:00 p.m.  
District Office, Third Floor**

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
March 22, 2007 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Green, Monica  
Kennedy, Stephen  
McKee-Leone, Virginia

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia  
Dumer, Olga

**Norco**

Flick, Arend  
Thomas, Jim

**RCCD**

Kauffman, Kristina  
Hall, Deborah

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Burchett, Gregory  
Davin, Richard  
Osgood-Treston, Brit  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**

Conyers, Lisa  
Galicia, Felipe  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Loewenstein, Gaither  
Pavlis, Bonnie  
Elizaldes, Andre

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron

**Staff:** David Torres

1. **Approval of 2/22/07 Minutes – MSC/Flick/Kennedy**  
Deborah Hall to replace Debbie DiThomas on the committee.
2. **Administrative Issues**
  - a. **Instructional Program Review – Round Two, 2007-2010**  
Training on March 23, 2007 for first timers. We are on a four-year cycle, with 12-13 due each year. The best revision was extracting the SLO's from the Comprehensive piece and adding it to the Annual Program Review.
  - b. **Additional updates for the Calendar for 2007**  
12-15 program reviews left to review. Thirteen to be reviewed in April. Suggested having another tentative meeting on May 10, 2007 to review the remaining documents. Documents being submitted in May will need to be complete with only minor revisions needed. The Program Reviews that are still due will need help with resources and expertise.
  - c. **Update on Fall 2006-2007 Program Review Cohort Revisions**  
Discussion on District Strategic Planning Process chart. Where does the Academic Senate fit into this process? They need to voice their concerns to faculty on each campus.
  - d. **Annual Program Review Documents – collection and distribution**  
Number of Annual Program Reviews received from 139 due:  
(102) completed; (27) reporting delays; (10) no communication  
Session on April 4, 2007 from 10:00 – 4:00 p.m. to review all Annual Program Reviews and pull out specific pieces from Other Resources piece and enter into the chart on Page 9 by resource needed.  
  
Need to gather budget information for resources needed to present for next year's budget.

3. **Program Review Submittals – Comments from each committee member will be compiled and e-mailed to appropriate faculty member**

a. **Journalism – No DAC approval**

No measurable objectives. The old format was used. Suggested holding until it meets minimum standards. Will forward editorial corrections to Joseph. The number of units needed for a certificate needs to be included. Committee will help them with the narrative portion. Need more information in History and Student Services sections. Most of the COR's are up to date. No prerequisite's needed to take this course such as English 1A? Discussion needs to take place between the two disciplines regarding prerequisites. If prerequisites are not needed, then maybe an advisory.

**Motion – MSC/Flick/Green – To table until they can present document to committee with suggested revisions.**

b. **Physical Sciences – James Cheney didn't attend**

No DAC approval. They used old and new format. Should be one or the other. Document not finished. Replace "Department" with "Physical Science Disciplines". Need to work on updating COR'S immediately. Assessment plan needs to be re-worked.

**Motion – MSC/Flick/Green – To table Physical Science program review. Provide comments and suggestions for revisions and bring back to the committee for review when revisions have been made.**

4. **Administrative Unit Program Review**

Need DAC's input. Need to ask what type of data will they collect next year if they don't have their Annual Program Review completed on time. The form on Page 9 will be filled out in our meeting on April 4, 2007. Kristina found Administrative Outcomes a website for a University and revised it to be used as a model for this document. Document will be presented at the DAC meeting on 3/23/07. Once approved, it will go forward to the Vice Chancellor's and Vice President's for their comments and revisions. Revisions will come back to the committee next month.

**Motion – MSC/Green/McKee-Leone – To approve Administrative Program Review Draft and move it forward.**

Jim Thomas to e-mail committee tentative dates and times for our meetings in the Fall.

5. **Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, April 26, 2007  
2:00 – 5:00 p.m.  
District Office, Third Floor**

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
April 26, 2007 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Green, Monica  
Hall, Lewis  
Kennedy, Stephen

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia  
Dumer, Olga

**Norco**

Flick, Arend  
Thomas, Jim  
Loewenstein, Gaither  
Elizaldes, Andre

**RCCD**

Kauffman, Kristina  
Hall, Deborah

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
McKee-Leone, Virginia  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**

Conyers, Lisa  
Galicia, Felipe  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Pavlis, Bonnie

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron

**Staff Absent:** David Torres

1. **Approval of 3/22/07 Minutes – MSC/Lewis Hall/Dumer**

2. **Administrative Issues**

- a. An additional program review meeting has been set for Thursday, May 10, 2007. On the agenda will be AOJ; Fire Technology; Air Conditioning; Art; Certified Nursing Assistant, Medical Assistant; Health Care Technician; & Community Interpretation. Tentative program reviews with revisions for Journalism; Geography and Physical Science. The May 24<sup>th</sup> agenda will include Culinary; Engineering; Human Services; Manufacturing; and Welding.
- b. Had approximately 30 in attendance for the Program Review Training. Kristina stated that at the CISOA (California Information Systems Officers Association & RP Group) conference they mentioned how difficult it is to get faculty to gather data let alone analyzing the data.
- c. Calendar Updates were presented.
- d. Jim or Kristina will be meeting with faculty.
- e. Annual Program Review update – Moreno Valley and Norco are complete. Riverside is missing five – Accounting, Air Conditioning; Photography; Culinary and Physical Sciences. Norco to setup procedure for annual program reviews to be sent to the Academic Planning Council, Student Services Planning Council and then onto the Administrative Planning Council and Strategic Planning Committee.
- f. Status of Administrative Program Review Process/Instructional program review was discussed. Will be meeting with Debbie DiThomas on the Student Services program review for integrating new format. An Administrative Program Review training will be held on May 9, 2007.
- g. Other – RCCD purchasing a new curriculum program with a program review piece

3. **Program Review Submittals – (comments will be compiled and forwarded to Richard Davin)**

- a. **Sociology** – Need numbers on pages; add revision date to document. Fix discrepancy between the two tables - 1b2 is the correct table. DAC has reviewed the Assessment piece and has stated that more specificity is needed. Need to develop a pre-test for SLO's. Arend will compile comments and e-mail to Richard. Need clarification on COR's. Need to turn in forms for those courses that should be deleted. Don't delete the cross reference HMS course. Student success rate needs to be addressed. The success rate expectation is 70%. Sociology

has a 62.9% success rate compared to 94% enrollment rate. Richard to add additional data which he had just received. Needs more collaboration with Moreno Valley and Norco campuses.

**Motion/MSF/Flick/Loewenstein – to table program review until revisions are made and presented at the May 24<sup>th</sup> meeting.**

- b. **Auto Technology** – Stephen Kennedy reporting for Paul O’Connell  
Needs DAC approval. Arend to e-mail comments to Paul O’Connell and Jim Thomas. Need to include pass rates, retention rates, success rates, etc. Could do a survey on students, alumni, employers, etc. COR’s are updated. Some courses need to be deleted. Include need to hire another FT faculty. Address the fact that the classes are located on the Riverside campus but they serve the District, students comes from all over Riverside County. Need mechanism in place for tracking.

**Motion/MSF/Lewis Hall/Green – to approve pending revisions and DAC approval**

**5. Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, May 10, 2007  
2:00 – 4:00 p.m.  
District Office, Third Floor**



PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
May 10, 2007 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Green, Monica  
Hall, Lewis

**Moreno Valley**

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Flick, Arend  
Loewenstein, Gaither  
Thomas, Jim

**RCCD**

Kauffman, Kristina

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Kennedy, Stephen  
McKee-Leone, Virginia  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia  
Conyers, Lisa  
Dumer, Olga  
G Galicia, Felipe  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Elizaldes, Andre  
Pavlis, Bonnie

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron  
Hall, Deborah

**Guests:** David Torres; Oliver Thompson, Bill Vincent

1. **Approval of 4/26/07 Minutes – MSC/Lewis Hall/Flick**
2. **Administrative Issues**
  - a. **Final meeting of the Program Review Committee - May 24, 2007**

Will have a heavy agenda. Eight program reviews outstanding. Need to have all remaining program reviews submitted in this meeting. Jim and Kristina will e-mail comments to each discipline and help with any revisions that need to be made during the summer. Revised copies will be e-mailed to committee members for their approval. Assessment portions will be e-mailed to Arend for his review.
  - b. **Calendar Suggestions for 2007-2008**

Meet once a month to prepare for 2<sup>nd</sup> round of Annual Reviews and for Administration Program Reviews. Administration Program Review Training rescheduled for May 23, 2007. Jim stated that he would like to keep meetings on Thursdays. He will send out an e-mail for suggestions for more convenient dates. Arend suggested having DAC and Program Review meetings back to back if possible.
  - c. Kristina will send out e-mails to solicit nominations for Fall committee members.
3. **Program Review Submittals (comments will be gathered and revisions e-mailed to Discipline**
  - a. **Community Interpretation** – Not presented
  - b. **Administration of Justice** – Oliver Thompson and Bill Vincent  
Comments: Need DAC approval. In process of updating COR's. Organization is confusing. Need to focus on significant areas and resubmit a more organized document for clarity. On page two separate all descriptions into one paragraph and all goals together in another paragraph.  
**Motion – to table until 1<sup>st</sup> meeting in Fall. Jim and Kristina will work with discipline on revisions for final draft due by August 15, 2007/MS/Lewis Hall/Crasnow**

**c. Fire Technology – Bill Vincent**

Comments: Need formatting corrections for stronger document. In process of updating COR's . Need DAC approval. Arend to e-mail comments on assessment to Bill Vincent. He needs to see success rates, certificate information, enrollment patterns, etc. addressed in document.

**Motion - to approve pending revisions, updated COR's and DAC approval  
MSC/Crasnow/Lewis Hall**

**d. Air Conditioning – Bob Burris – not present**

COR's updated. Need DAC approval in meeting on May 18, 2007. Needs clarification on assessment efforts. Need to find a way to track students taking one class and then getting a job. David Torres to find out what mechanism Dental Hygiene discipline is using to track students after they have completed courses and have found a job. Change "Gate Program" to "Gateway to College". Use "locally and state approved" terminology.

**Motion – to approve pending minor revisions and DAC approval/MSC/Crasnow/Lewis Hall**

**e. Physical Science (revised) – Not presented**

**Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, May 24, 2007  
2:00 – 5:00 p.m.  
District Office, Third Floor**

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
May 24, 2007 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Hall, Lewis  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia  
Dumer, Olga

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Flick, Arend  
Elizaldes, Andre  
Thomas, Jim

**RCCD**

Green, Monica  
Kauffman, Kristina

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Kennedy, Stephen  
McKee-Leone, Virginia

**Moreno Valley**

Conyers, Lisa  
Galicia, Felipe  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Loewenstein, Gaither  
Pavlis, Bonnie

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron  
Hall, Deborah

**Guests:** George Gage; Lisa Hausladen; Joe Eckstein, Les Dean; Stephen Horn; Todd Wales; David Torres;

1. **Approval of 5/10/07 Minutes – MSC/Lewis Hall/Crasnow**
2. **Administrative Issues – Motion/ MSC/Lewis Hall/Crasnow** - Jim Thomas appointed co-chair for 2007-2008 academic year. Jim would like to keep meetings on Thursdays. There is a meeting set for August 28th for program reviews undergoing revisions over the summer with Jim and Kristina's help. Annual Program Review forms will be improved for next year. Good turnout for the Administrative Program Review training held yesterday. Another training to be scheduled for those with schedule conflicts.
3. **Program Review Submittals**  
**Sociology** – Richard Davin not present  
Comments: Conditional approval pending from DAC requiring that the discipline provides us with documentation in the form of a report and a physical appearance for their first meeting in Spring 2008.  
**Motion/MSC/Crasnow/Dumer** – to approve program review  
  
**Art** – Stephen Horn present  
Comments: Assessment to focus on one course. Conditional approval pending from DAC requiring that the discipline provides us with documentation in the form of a report and a physical appearance for their first meeting in Spring 2008. It was suggested that they could use student surveys as a means to measure SLO's. Clarify link to mission statement. Create an appendix for the history portion listing professions of faculty named. Clarify 15 year relationship with the Riverside Schools for the Arts. Include a brief description of student enrollment and retention rates.  
**Motion/MSC/Crasnow/Flick** – approve program review pending revisions  
  
**Engineering** – Todd Wales present  
Comments: It was suggested that surveying employers and graduates could be used as a tracking mechanism. Suggestion of having a survey incorporated online for students accessing their grades. Include the Norco mission statement. Define SLO's for next round.  
**Motion/MSC/Crasnow/Bufalino** – approval pending minor revisions

**Geography** – Joe Eckstein and Les Dean present

Comments: No DAC approval. All CORs updated. Missing history section and summary section. (Les to e-mail history section) Need a specific list of SLOs to be measured for Fall 2007 accompanied by a list of common multiple choice questions to be administered. Include at least one strategic initiative designed to improve the success rate of geography students. Major conclusions should be drawn from the data. Need to mention trend towards technology.

**Motion/MS/Crasnow/Green** – Table until meeting on August 28<sup>th</sup> with either Joe Eckstein or Les Dean present at the meeting.

**Community Intrepretation** - George Gage present

Comments: Most of the CORs are updated and will go to Curriculum committee in Fall 2007. IMC to videotape an oral testing session for measuring SLO's. Will meet with Arend Flick on assessment report for revisions needed.

**Motion/MS/Crasnow/Lewis Hall** – to table until the first meeting of the Fall semester.

**Medical Assisting** – Lisa Hausladen

Comments: Need to work on assessment component. Need more data on enrollment and retention rates. Need a stronger link to the mission statement. In the process of updating COR's. State in your program review that you would like to market your program.

**Motion/MS/Crasnow/Bufalino** – received program review. Table until meeting on August 28th

**Human Services** – James Banks not present

Comments: Will be finished by June. Will e-mail revisions back and forth to be ready for meeting in Fall 2007.

**Culinary** – Joe working with Chef Bobby on program review for completion in Summer for Fall 2007 meeting.

**Journalism (Revised)** – Allan Lovelace not present

Comments: Conditional approval pending from DAC requiring that the discipline provides us with documentation in the form of a report and a physical appearance for their first meeting in Spring 2008. Document needs more clarity.

**Motion/MS/Crasnow/Flick** – to approve program review incorporating the DAC conditional acceptance.

**Next Meeting:**

**Tuesday, August 28, 2007  
12:00 – 3:00 p.m.  
District Office, Lg. Conference Room**

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
August 28, 2007 12:00 – 3:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**  
Hall, Lewis

**Moreno Valley**  
Bufalino, Patricia  
Dumer, Olga  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**  
Loewenstein, Gaither  
Flick, Arend  
Elizaldes, Andre  
Thomas, Jim

**RCCD**  
Kauffman, Kristina

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**  
Acharya, Surekha  
Kennedy, Stephen  
McKee-Leone, Virginia  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**  
Conyers, Lisa  
Galicia, Felipe

**Norco**  
Crasnow, Sharon  
Pavlis, Bonnie

**RCCD**  
Brown, Aaron  
Hall, Deborah  
Green, Monica

**Guests:** Richard Davin; David Torres; Khalil Andacheh; Les Dean; Joe Eckstein

1. **Approval of 5/24/07 Minutes – MSC/Hall/Bufalino**

Richard Davin presented questions to the committee regarding his program review for Sociology which was submitted in the May 12, 2007 meeting. Revisions and DAC approval are needed.

2. **Administrative Issues**

- a. Committee reviewed vacancies in the membership list and how it's comprised for nomination of new members. It was suggested that the Associate VP of Facilities should be included in this list.
- b. Committee agreed to have future meetings on Thursday from 2:00-4:00 p.m. Instructional program reviews are on the agenda for September 13<sup>th</sup> and Administration program reviews are on the agenda for September 27<sup>th</sup>.

AOJ - on agenda for September 13<sup>th</sup>

Community Interpretation – to receive final draft on September 13<sup>th</sup>

Culinary – not submitted yet

Human Services – tabled until September 13<sup>th</sup>

Physical Sciences – pending revisions and DAC approval

Student Services Program Review cycle - Comprehensive review every two years and annual review every year.

**Motion to accept/MS/ unanimous**

3. **Program Review Submittals**

- a. **Healthcare Technician** – Take off highlights on page three. Identify tables. Submit assessment plan to DAC on September 7<sup>th</sup> for approval. Collaborate with Cal State San Bernardino and inform them that RCC holds BSN classes their students might be interested in. Need a survey for assessment.

**Motion to approve pending DAC approval/MS/ Hall/ Dumer**

- b. **Geography** – Needs DAC approval. This is the second submission. Missing Section “D” – Curriculum & Programs. Student Outcomes Assessment should be Section “E”. Page 13 -

revise sentence regarding student success. Page 10 – what are you going to do with data found regarding lower success rates. Page 17 - assessment project needs more detail.

**Motion to approve pending revisions & DAC approval/MSC/Hall/Loomis**

c. **Occupational Education Grants and Projects Unit**

Page 8 – what are they planning to do with the data? Ron needs to provide technical support and training to other Occ Ed departments/disciplines, develop program level student learning outcome assessment and define SLO degree patterns.

**Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, September 13, 2007  
2:00 – 4:00 p.m.  
District Office, Lg. Conference Room**

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
September 13, 2007 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Barron, Richard

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Elizaldes, Andre  
Thomas, Jim  
Tschetter, Sheryl

**RCCD**

Kauffman, Kristina  
Green, Monica

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Hall, Lewis  
Kennedy, Stephen  
McKee-Leone, Virginia  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**

Beckstrom, Doug  
Conyers, Lisa  
Dumer, Olga  
Galicia, Felipe

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Flick, Arend  
Loewenstein, Gaither

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron

**Guests:** Lisa Hausladen, Nancy Gall, George Gage, Bobby Moghaddam

1. **Approval of 8/28/07 Minutes – MSC/Bufalino/Loomis**

2. **Administrative Issues**

a. Jim will present a request to the Norco Academic Senate on Monday, September 17, 2007 for additional committee members.

b. **Calendar for 2007-2008 – Meeting dates are as follows:**

*September 27<sup>th</sup>* – For Administrative Program Reviews. Comment on content and clarity only. Will post to web after revisions have been received. Almost all of the Administrative Program Reviews have been submitted.

*October 25<sup>th</sup>* – For Round Two of Comprehensive Reviews

*November 29<sup>th</sup>* – For Round Two of Comprehensive Reviews

*December 13<sup>th</sup>* – If needed to tie up loose ends

Second round of Program Reviews starts December 4<sup>th</sup>.

Kristina reported on the progress of Chuck McIntyre's report. He has gone through all our Program Review documents online and stated that we have a good assessment plan. He said we should be exceptionally proud of the work our faculty have done.

3. **Program Review Submittals – To DAC on October 1st**

a. **Administration of Justice** – The program for restructuring AOJ is new. Page 10 should have Cordell Briggs's name instead of Bill Vincent. Page 12 – note that EMT and Paramedics are not a discipline of Public Safety at Ben Clark. They are a discipline of Health, Human & Public Services on the Moreno Valley campus. Page 46 should state that only 64 COR's have been completed. State that they are engaged in the assessment process. They haven't had any help from faculty which is mostly adjunct faculty.

Needs a DAC rating of 2 or better to be approved by the Program Review Committee.

**Amended Motion - to approve AOJ program review pending DAC rating of 2 or better  
MSC/Green/Bufalino**

b. **Community Interpretation – Reread - George Gage present (DAC rating 3)**

Strong assessment component. Statement was made that the new linguistic program will help strengthen the CMI program. Diagnostic test in Spanish has been submitted. Students tend to take 18 units but don't go for the AS degree.

**Motion -to approve CMI Program Review/MSC/Bufalino/Green**

**c. Culinary – Bobby Moghaddam present (To DAC on October 1<sup>st</sup>)**

Coherent document. Page 19 – list units for each culinary class. Seven out of ten COR's updated. Arend is working on assessment plan with Bobby. List certificate patterns in a table for more clarity. Change title to Riverside City College Culinary Academy in place of using "County". Add pre-2003 history to an appendix or format in such a way as to make it clear that these are two different sections.

**Motion – to accept pending DAC rating of 2 or better/MSC/Loomis/Green**

**d. Medical Assisting – Lisa Hausladen present (to DAC October 1<sup>st</sup>)**

There are still 4 or 5 COR's to be updated. Page two – title as a chart. Include needs from Resource Section in your Annual Program Review. There are no assessment outcomes that leads to improvement. Will work with Arend or Sheryl on assessment plan.

**Motion – to accept pending DAC rating of 2 or better/MSC/Green/Loomis**

**e. Physical Sciences – Reread (James Cheney not present) – to DAC on October 1<sup>st</sup>**

Good assessment section. Missing Sections C & H. Can't move forward until we have these sections. COR's haven't been updated in the last six years.

**Motion – to table until Sections C & H are completed, COR's are updated and pending DAC rating of 2 or better/MSC/Loomis/Green**

**f. Photography – Reread (Nancy Gall present) DAC rating 2**

Has all the key elements but needs some reformatting. All COR's are updated. Sheryl will help Nancy on revising the rubric.

**Motion – to approve Photography Program Review/MSC/Tschetter/Green**

**g. Human Services – James Banks not present – DAC rating 1**

It is well written but written according to the old method. Page three – the objectives are not clear. Provide statistical data.

**Motion – tabled pending clarification and inclusion of data and DAC rating of 2 or better MSC/Loomis/Barron**

DAC agreed to not recommend approvals or disapproval of assessment plans but instead use a five point rating system to indicate what stage a discipline is at in its assessment work. Then the Program Review Committee can decide whether inadequacies are enough to prevent self-studies from being accepted.

**Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, September 27, 2007  
2:00 – 4:00 p.m.  
District Office, Lg. Conference Room**



PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
September 27, 2007 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

McKee-Leone, Virginia

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia  
Dumer, Olga

**Norco**

Elizaldes, Andre  
Thomas, Jim  
Tschetter, Sheryl  
Flick, Arend  
Loewenstein, Gaither

**RCCD**

Kauffman, Kristina

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Hall, Lewis  
Kennedy, Stephen  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**

Beckstrom, Doug  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron  
Green, Monica

**Guests:** David Torres

1. **Approval of 9/13/07 Minutes – MSC/Bufalino/Flick** *(The following revisions to be made to the minutes: Remove Lisa Conyers' and Felipe Galicia's name from committee. Include Arend Flick as being absent 9/13/07.*
2. **Administrative Issues**
  - a. After the accreditation visit, we will have nominations for new committee members.
  - b. **Calendar for 2007-2008**  
*October 25<sup>th</sup> – Review tabled Administration Program Reviews and review Round Two of Comprehensive Reviews*
3. **Program Review Submittals - Administrative**

This is not a strict examination of these documents. The committee will review for completeness and motion to receive reports only. Guidelines will be revised for goals and objectives. Annual cycle for Administrative Program Reviews.

  - a. **Grants and Contracts** – Nothing submitted for item #7. Goals and objectives are vague. Revisions will be made to the template for future submittals.  
**Motion - to receive Grants and Contracts Report/MSCFlick/Bufalino**
  - b. **Human Resources** – Is Appendix J necessary being 28 pages long?  
**Motion - to receive Human Resource Report/MSCBufalino/Tschetter**
  - c. **Information Services** - Sections missing. On agenda for October 25<sup>th</sup> meeting.  
**Motion - to table report**
  - d. **MV Academic Affairs - Education Section** – Goals and objectives need some measurable benchmarks.  
*Instruction Section* - Good flowchart with notes. Growth objective 1%. They didn't want to commit to 5% since there's no room to grow. Need to show why they choose 1% over 5%.  
*Health & Science* - Land and construction may be donated for a new building.  
*Public Safety Education & Training* – The instructional program review document is a work in progress and they have made substantial gains. Assessment plan still needs work.  
*Library & Learning Resources* – They had the most references on the instructional program review.  
**Motion – to receive MV Academic Affairs Report/MSC/Tschetter/Dumer**

- e. **MV Business Services** – Included the original organizational chart along with a proposed organizational chart which allows them to include hourly positions as permanent full-time.  
*Facilities Section - #7* has no submittals from instructional program review.  
*Maintenance Section* – Main source of funding is enrollment growth so it's unrealistic to have a growth goal of 1%.  
*Grounds* – Good to have separate sections for these reports  
*Custodial* – Requesting a \$291,000 building  
**Motion – to receive MV Business Services Report/MSC/Bufalino/Kauffman**
  
- f. **Norco Academic Affairs** – Objectives related to enrollment growth. Include what each section needs and submit for the district.  
*Administrative Unit Section* – Expands on areas of concern. Staffing needs will be included.  
*Library/IMC Section* – No comments  
**Motion – to receive Norco Academic Affairs Report/Tschetter/Bufalino**
  
- g. **Norco Business Services**  
**Motion – to receive Facilities, Department and Business report/MSC/Bufalino/Elizalde**
  
- h. **Institutional Effectiveness** – Includes Institutional Reporting, Institutional Research, Information Architecture and Instruction. Page 23 amend five year staffing profile. Page 16 to update discipline data for Moreno Valley and Norco ESL.  
**Motion – to receive Institutional Effectiveness Report/MSC/Tschetter/Dumer**
  
- i. **Occupational Education** - Not clear on SLO's. What is the role of the unit in measuring SLO's? Be more specific. Need to look at program level assessment.  
**Motion – to receive Occupational Education Report/MSC/Flick/Bufalino**
  
- j. **Public Affairs** – Need marketing plan. They state there is no money to create a plan.  
*Foundation Section* - Have office space on the Norco Campus in Portable B. For #8 what is strategy 11?  
*Institutional Advancement* – No comments  
*Communication and Web Development* - First thing to see when you go to rcc.edu website should be college information instead of District information.  
*Administrative Support Unit* - #8 what are the major objectives?  
**Motion – to receive Public Affairs Report/MSCFlick/Bufalino**
  
- k. **Riverside Campus Academic Affairs** - Tabled until next meeting in October.
  
- l. **Riverside Business Services** – Tabled until next meeting in October.
  
- m. **Workforce Development** - No five-year staffing needs? This department is run strictly on grant money. Need to establish another way to fund this program in case grant money is not funded. Write this into the goals and objectives. Need more collaboration in this area.  
**Motion – to receive Workforce Development Report/MSC/Tschetter/Flick**
  
- n. **Open Campus** – not on agenda  
 Is on-line assessing Bob's responsibility? Bob is preparing a FACT book on Distance Education. Academic Senate needs to address the issue of playing the leadership role.  
**Motion – to receive Open Campus Report/MSC/Flick/Tschetter**

We have Instructional Program Review, Administrative Program Review and Student Services Program Review. We may need a fourth for Economic Development and Community Education.

**Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, October 25, 2007**  
**2:00 – 4:00 p.m.**  
**District Office, Lg. Conference Room**

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
October 25, 2007 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Hall, Lewis  
Kennedy, Stephen

**Moreno Valley**

Dumer, Olga  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Elizaldes, Andre  
Flick, Arend  
Gray, Alexis  
Thomas, Jim

**RCCD**

Green, Monica  
Kauffman, Kristina

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Hall, Deborah

McKee-Leone, Virginia  
Sarkis, Rosemarie

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Parks, Jason  
  
Loewenstein, Gaither  
Tschetter, Sheryl

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron  
Schwerdtfeger,  
Patrick  
Vito, Ron

**Guests:** David Torres; Diane Solorzano, Tammy DiBenedetto

1. **Approval of 9/27/07 Minutes – MSC/Elizaldes/Flick**
2. **Administrative Issues**
  - a. Nominations for New Program Review Members – Jason Parks, Alexis Gray have been elected as new members of the committee.
  - b. **Annual Program Review Report 2006-2007**  
Focus on Annual Program Reviews due 2008 Spring semester.
  - c. **Update on Program Review Documents** -  
Our next meeting will be to finalize the process and make adjustments to the program review document. DAC will have revisions by November 16<sup>th</sup> meeting. Timeline for revisions to submit to the Academic Senates are:  
Comprehensive review – by the end of the Fall semester  
Annual Program Review – late February 2008  
Instructional Program Reviews to be submitted to Academic Planning Council by April 2008  
  
Discussion on getting the program level assessment started.
  - c. **Interdisciplinary Program Review – Request for Direction**  
Discussion on the need to develop a program review process for interdisciplinary programs such as Honors and Puente.  
**Table until November meeting for further discussion**
3. **Program Review Submittals**
  - a. **Physical Science (re-submit)**  
Missing pieces have been included. Has a DAC rating of 2. 55% success rate. Students are not prepared. There may be a need for a reading prerequisite. Re-examine how courses should be taught. The assessment test doesn't limit the student's entry into other classes.  
**Motion – to approve Physical Science Program Review/MSCFlick/Hall**
  - b. **English Round Two** – Diane Solorzano and Tammy DiBenedetto present

Diane organized a team of four to help discipline write this program review. Numbers didn't always add up to 100%. Revise statement on ethnicity. State that recruitment process needs to reach out to a more diverse population.

**Motion – to approve English Round Two Program Review pending approval of DAC rating on Monday.**

\*First agenda item for November 29<sup>th</sup> meeting: to revise assessment rating needed for approval. Set rubric for DAC rating for next round.

**Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, November 29, 2007  
2:00 – 4:00 p.m.  
District Office, Lg. Conference Room**

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
November 29, 2007 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Hall, Barbara  
Hall, Lewis

**Moreno Valley**

Dumer, Olga  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Elizaldes, Andre  
Gray, Alexis  
Parks, Jason  
Thomas, Jim  
Tschetter, Sheryl

**RCCD**

Green, Monica  
Kauffman, Kristina

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Hall, Deborah  
Kennedy, Stephen  
McKee-Leone, Virginia  
Sarkis, Rosemarie  
Schwerdtfeger, Patrick

**Moreno Valley**

Bufalino, Patricia

**Norco**

Flick, Arend  
Loewenstein, Gaither

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron  
Vito, Ron

**Guests:** David Torres, Rom Masterson, Leo Truttman

1. **Approval of 10/25/07 Minutes – MSC/Gray/L.Hall**

2. **Administrative Issues**

a. **New Program Review members:** Alexis Gray, Barbara Hall

b. **Update on Program Review Documents**

Revisions submitted by DAC on Comprehensive Program Review Round Two. Page 6 – 1<sup>st</sup> revision shows we have gone from the planning stage to making progress. Need to include environmental scan website address. Training to take place in Winter 2008. Section to be added on assessment techniques. Page 10 – moved section on mission and relationship to college to Section E. Assessment plans need to be implemented. Courses will eventually be mapped to programs.

Accrediting commission now states that they want SLO's for every single certificate and program along with an annual review. A column will be added to the Timeline for Assessing Programs to include when data will be analyzed or finished. This document will be going to the Academic Senates on Monday. Page 14 – In Resource section add to comprehensive document long-term major resource planning.

**Motion – to receive revisions to the Comprehensive Program Review Round Two document/MS/L.Hall/Loomis**

c. **Interdisciplinary Program Review Update**

Jim Thomas gave Kathleen Sell's point of view on how these programs will be affected by resource allocations. This needs to be addressed in case there's no grant money in the future for these programs.

d. **Report by Leeshawn Moore on Program Review Focus Group meetings**

Faculty are waiting for a response to their submission of their Annual Program Reviews. Will they be will receiving the resources they ask for? Norco would like to have training on their

campus. Discussion on Annual Program Review process. The administrators have the annual program reviews and will decide when to submit to the District Strategic Planning Committee.

3. **Program Review Submittals – Round Two**

a. **Dental Hygiene** – Donna Lesser not present

Comments to be forwarded to Donna Lesser. DAC score of 5. Very impressive document. Only minor revisions needed.

**Motion – to receive Dental Hygiene Program Review/MSCL.Hall/Elizalde**

b. **Chemistry** – Leo Truttman present

Data missing in Appendix A. Need to address efficiencies and student success. Remove statement on page 6 under “Assessment” stating assessment will include...” Add a sentence stating that no biology courses are required as a prerequisite for Chemistry. On page 8 list who the faculty are and where they are located. Leo will meet with Sheryl Tschetter regarding assessment portion. Last section missing on Summary Analysis.

**Motion – table Chemistry Program Review until first meeting in Spring semester/MSCL.Hall/Gray**

b. **Philosophy** – Rom Masterson and Sharon Crasnow present

Impressive document. They have done a lot of work on the SLO's. The Outreach Section doesn't address counseling efforts. It was suggested that a program on Ethnic Studies could be created and to add this information to Page 8.

**Motion – to receive Philosophy Program Review pending review by DAC/MSCL.Hall/Loomis**

**Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, December 13, 2007  
2:00 – 4:00 p.m.  
District Office, Lg. Conference Room**

PROGRAM REVIEW COMMITTEE  
December 13, 2007 2:00 – 4:00 pm  
MINUTES

**Members Present:**

**Riverside**

Daddona-Moya, Michelle  
Hall, Barbara  
Kennedy, Stephen

**Moreno Valley**

Dumer, Olga

**Norco**

Elizaldes, Andre  
Gray, Alexis  
Thomas, Jim  
Tschetter, Sheryl

**RCCD**

Green, Monica  
Kauffman, Kristina

**Members Absent:**

**Riverside**

Acharya, Surekha  
Hall, Deborah  
Hall, Lewis  
McKee-Leone, Virginia  
Sarkis, Rosemarie  
Schwerdtfeger, Patrick

**Moreno Valley**

Beckstrom, Doug  
Bufalino, Patti  
Loomis, Rebecca

**Norco**

Crasnow, Sharon  
Flick, Arend  
Loewenstein, Gaither  
Parks, Jason

**RCCD**

Brown, Aaron  
Vito, Ron

**Guests:** Carol Farrar; Margarita Shirinian; David Torres

1. **Approval of 11/13/07 Minutes – MSC/Elizaldes/Gray**
2. **Administrative Issues**
  - a. New Program Review members: Michelle Daddona-Moya
  - b. Possible Program Review Dates and Times  
February 28, 2008  
March 27, 2008  
April 24, 2008  
May 29, 2008  
Times TBA. Would like to schedule DAC meetings back to back with Program Review.
  - c. Revisions to Comprehensive Program Review Document  
Draft document submitted to the academic senate on each campus. E-mail sent to Riv-all regarding all program reviews going to the next round. No response.
  - d. Other  
Discussion on Focus Group Findings by Leeshawn Moore. Request for training on budget allocation models. Comments will help us improve our process.
3. **Program Review Submittals – Round Two**
  - a. **Dental Assisting** – Donna Lesser not present. Comments will be forward to her. Needs a clinical lab assistant. Page five under “students” category – need to solve problem for students. Missing “Resource” section. Change Ron Vito’s title to VP of Occupational Education. Received a DAC rating of 5.  
**Motion – to receive Dental Assisting Program Review/MS/Tschetter/Kennedy**

- b. **ESL** – Olga Dumer and Margarita Shirinian present  
On Page 5 in the first paragraph define “Generation 1.5 students”. Under subsection “A” link mission statement to District or campus. Page 3 – should be 14% student enrollment. Revise Appendix “B” listing to seven courses. Move information on page 8 to “Data” section. Page 25 “Resource” section should appear earlier in document as item “H” and “Summary Analysis” as item “I”. On page 37 add a footnote to Appendix “B” for clarification. Their assessment section would be a good example to use for other program reviews. Received a DAC rating of 5  
**Motion – to receive ESL program review/MSC/Tschetter/B.Hall**
- c. **Psychology** – Carol Farrar present  
Kristina has corrected the reference to Strategic Initiatives throughout the document. This was not a reference to Strategic Initiatives but to SLOs only. Write a paragraph on Strategic Initiatives. Received a DAC rating of 3.  
**Motion – to receive Psychology program review/B.Hall/Gray**

**Next Meeting:**

**Thursday, February 28, 2008**  
**Time: TBA**  
**District Office, Lg. Conference Room**